Interactive comment on “Investigating uncertainties in global gridded datasets of climate extremes” by R. J. H. Dunn et al.

Anonymous Referee #3

Received and published: 7 July 2014

The manuscript "Investigating uncertainties in global gridded datasets of climate extremes" by Dunn et al. is focused on the evaluation of uncertainties affecting a specific gridded dataset. The study is interesting and useful for the climate community. However, as highlighted by the other two referees (I fully agree with their comments), several minor issues should be solved before publication. The authors should give "more weight" to the regional differences and improve the explanation and description of the (very interesting) results connected with the Taylor diagrams. Linear trend is not always the optimal choice, so other options should be explored (e.g., change points affecting the global-regional time series). The introduction should be improved and better linked to the rest of the manuscript. Readability can be improved as well and typos must be corrected.
Finally, a couple of important specific comments:

p2109, 1: this is questionable. Other (more complex) methods exist that can take better into account the spatial structure of the given field. ADW could be appropriate for indices but not the most appropriate for every (irregularly) data set. p2110/2111, 27/1: this statement is wrong. Correlation cannot be used to assess trend similarities. p2111, 28: This is simply called the Theil-Sen estimator

Interactive comment on Clim. Past Discuss., 10, 2105, 2014.