

Interactive comment on “Simulating the temperature and precipitation signal in an Alpine ice core” by S. Brönnimann et al.

C. Barbante (Editor)

barbante@unive.it

Received and published: 18 April 2013

Editor comments to CP-2012-187 “Simulating the temperature and precipitation signal in an Alpine Ice core” by S. Brönnimann and co-authors

Dear Dr Brönnimann, I have read with great interest the MS on the simulation of temperature and precipitation signal in an Alpine ice core and the comments and suggestion made by the referees. I found the manuscript very interesting for our journal, since it uses a simple but well constrain model to prove the assumptions. However after reading carefully the manuscript and the comments raised by the referees I think that it must be duly revised before being accepted for publication in CP. My major concerns, also pointed out by the referees comments, are that the MS did not take into account the most recent literature in the field and it seems written without having considered

C3662

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper



most of the papers appeared in this context. The MS also cites a CPD paper of Mariani et al. (one of the co-author of the present paper) that can be highlighted as a companion paper, considering many common features. The model proposed must be better explain, taking the advantage that an Open Access journal do not pose stringent limit of space. As a reader I was lost, when I wanted to understand in details the boundary conditions imposed to the model. In addition, beside comparing the output of the model with literature data it will be interesting to apply the same approach to other areas. This would certainly improve the quality of the MS. I would therefore suggest you to reply to the referees comments answering in detail on each of their comments, and mentioning which changes are made. I also encourage you to submit a new revised version of the manuscript that will be reconsidered for publication.

Best Regards, Carlo Barbante

Interactive comment on Clim. Past Discuss., 8, 6111, 2012.

CPD

8, C3662–C3663, 2013

Interactive
Comment

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper



C3663