Clim. Past Discuss., 2, 711–743, 2006 www.clim-past-discuss.net/2/711/2006/ © Author(s) 2006. This work is licensed under a Creative Commons License.



Climate of the Past Discussions is the access reviewed discussion forum of Climate of the Past

# Glacial – interglacial atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> change: a simple "hypsometric effect" on deep-ocean carbon sequestration? \*

# L. C. Skinner

Godwin Laboratory for Palaeoclimate Research, Department of Earth Sciences, University of Cambridge, CB2 3EQ, UK

Received: 20 July 2006 – Accepted: 4 September 2006 – Published: 7 September 2006

Correspondence to: L. C. Skinner (luke00@esc.cam.ac.uk)

\*Invited contribution by L. Skinner, one of the EGU Outstanding Young Scientist Award winners 2006

711

# Abstract

Given the magnitude and dynamism of the deep marine carbon reservoir, it is almost certain that past glacial – interglacial fluctuations in atmospheric  $CO_2$  have relied at least in part on changes in the carbon storage capacity of the deep sea. To date,

- <sup>5</sup> physical ocean circulation mechanisms that have been proposed as viable explanations for glacial – interglacial CO<sub>2</sub> change have focussed almost exclusively on dynamical or kinetic processes. Here, a simple mechanism is proposed for increasing the carbon storage capacity of the deep sea that operates via changes in the volume of southern-sourced deep-water filling the ocean basins, as dictated by the hypsometry
- of the ocean floor. It is proposed that a water-mass that occupies more than the bottom 3 km of the ocean will essentially determine the carbon content of the marine reservoir. Hence by filling this interval with southern-sourced deep-water (enriched in dissolved CO<sub>2</sub> due to its particular mode of formation) the amount of carbon sequestered in the deep sea may be greatly increased. A simple box-model is used to test this hypothesis,
- and to investigate its implications. It is suggested that up to 70% of the observed glacial – interglacial  $CO_2$  change might be explained by the replacement of northern-sourced deep-water below 2.5 km water depth by its southern counterpart. Most importantly, it is found that an increase in the volume of southern-sourced deep-water allows glacial  $CO_2$  levels to be simulated easily with only modest changes in Southern Ocean biolog-
- ical export or overturning. If incorporated into the list of contributing factors to marine carbon sequestration, this mechanism may help to significantly reduce the "deficit" of explained glacial – interglacial CO<sub>2</sub> change.

# 1 Explaining glacial – interglacial CO<sub>2</sub> change

Although it is clear that changes in atmospheric  $CO_2$  have remained tightly coupled with global climate change throughout the past ~730 000 years (Siegenthaler et al., 2005), the mechanisms responsible for pacing and moderating  $CO_2$  change remain a mystery. The magnitude of the marine carbon reservoir, and its inevitable response to changes in atmospheric  $CO_2$  (Broecker, 1982a), guarantees a significant role for the ocean in glacial – interglacial  $CO_2$  change. Based on thermodynamic considerations, glacial atmospheric  $CO_2$  would be reduced by up to ~30 ppm simply due to

- the increased solubility of CO<sub>2</sub> in a colder glacial ocean; however this reduction would be counteracted by the reduced solubility of CO<sub>2</sub> in a more saline glacial ocean and by a large reduction in the terrestrial biosphere under glacial conditions (which would release carbon to the other global reservoirs) (Broecker and Peng, 1989; Sigman and Boyle, 2000). The bulk of the glacial – interglacial CO<sub>2</sub> change therefore remains to be
- explained by more complex inter-reservoir exchange mechanisms, and the most viable proposals involve either the biological- or the physical "carbon pumps" of the ocean. Indeed it appears that whichever mechanism is invoked to explain glacial interglacial CO<sub>2</sub> change must involve changes in the sequestration of CO<sub>2</sub> in the deepest marine reservoir (Broecker, 1982a; Boyle, 1988, 1992; Broecker and Peng, 1989).
- <sup>15</sup> To date, three main types of conceptual model have been advanced in order to explain glacial – interglacial atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> change: 1) those involving an increase in the export of organic carbon to the deep sea, either via increased nutrient availability at low latitudes or via increased efficiency of nutrient usage at high latitudes (Broecker, 1982a, b; Knox and McElroy, 1984); 2) those involving a reduction in the ventilation
- of water exported to the deep Southern Ocean (Siegenthaler and Wenk, 1984; Togg-weiler and Sarmiento, 1985), either via sea-ice "capping" (Keeling and Stephens, 2001) or a change in ocean interior mixing efficiency (Toggweiler, 1999; Gildor and Tziperman, 2001); and 3) those involving changes in ocean chemistry and the "carbonate compensation" mechanism, possibly involving changes in the ratio of organic carbon
- and carbonate fluxes to the deep sea (Archer and Maier-Reimer, 1994). Each of these conceptual models has its own set of difficulties in explaining the pattern and magnitude of past glacial interglacial CO<sub>2</sub> change (Archer et al., 2000b; Sigman and Boyle, 2000), and none is likely to have operated in isolation. However, one aspect of all of the proposed models that emerges as being fundamental to any mechanism propos-

713

ing to explain glacial – interglacial  $CO_2$  change is the balance between carbon export from the surface-ocean and carbon "reflux" by the overturning circulation of the ocean. These two processes, one biological and one physical, essentially determine the balance of carbon input into and output from (and therefore the carbon concentration of) the deepest marine reservoirs.

The regions of deep-water formation in the North Atlantic and especially in the Southern Ocean play a key role in setting the "physical side" of this balance, with which this study is primarily concerned. In the North Atlantic, carbon uptake via the "solubility pump" is enhanced by the large temperature change that surface water must undergo

- <sup>10</sup> before being exported into the ocean interior. The formation of North Atlantic deepwater therefore represents an efficient mechanism for mixing CO<sub>2</sub> deep into the ocean interior (Sabine et al., 2004); though only to the extent that it is not completely compensated for (or indeed over-compensated for) by the eventual return flow of carbonenriched deep-water back to the surface. It is in controlling the extent to which the re-
- turn flow of deep-water to the surface (which occurs primarily in the Southern Ocean) represents a net "reflux" of carbon to the atmosphere that the formation of deep-water in the Southern Ocean plays a pivotal role in controlling the overall efficiency of the ocean's physical carbon pump. The key point here, as pointed out by Broecker (1999), is that up-welled (cold, carbon-rich) deep-water will only yield up its dissolved CO<sub>2</sub> if it
- is able to equilibrate with the atmosphere, and hence if the residence time of any upwelled water that actually reaches the surface-ocean is sufficiently long with respect to the gas-exchange rate, and the rate of biological export.

Today, the bulk of the deep ocean (although not the deep Atlantic) is "ventilated" from the Southern Ocean, by Circumpolar Deep Water (CDW) that is exported northwards into the various ocean basins from the eastward circulating Antarctic Circumpolar Current (ACC) (Orsi et al., 1999). This deep-water remains relatively poorly equilibrated with the atmosphere, and therefore maintains an elevated CO<sub>2</sub> content (TCO<sub>2</sub>). In part this is because the rate of ocean – atmosphere CO<sub>2</sub> exchange cannot keep up with the rate of overturning in the uppermost Southern Ocean (Bard, 1988); however it is primarily because the bulk of southern sourced deep- and bottom-water is either produced via a combination of brine rejection below sea-ice and entrainment from the sub-surface, or else converted from "aged" northern-sourced deep-waters that are up-welled in the Southern Ocean (Orsi et al., 1999; Speer et al., 2000; Webb and Sug-

- <sup>5</sup> inohara, 2001). Intense turbulent vertical mixing around topographic features in the deep Southern Ocean helps to enhance the amount of "carbon rich" sub-surface water that is incorporated into the CDW (from above and from below), and subsequently exported northwards to the Atlantic and Indo-Pacific (Orsi et al., 1999; Naviera Garabato et al., 2004). The process of deep-water export in the Southern Ocean may therefore
- <sup>10</sup> be viewed as a mechanism for "recycling" carbon-rich water within the ocean interior, circumventing ocean atmosphere exchange, and eventual CO<sub>2</sub> leakage to the atmosphere. Given these considerations, it is clear that investigations of the mechanisms of CO<sub>2</sub> draw-down by the physical ocean circulation will depend sensitively on the exact flow scheme that is either posited (in box-models) or simulated (in general circulation models; GCMs), particularly for the Southern Ocean.
- The first investigation into the potential importance of the overturning circulation in setting the atmospheric  $CO_2$  concentration was performed by Broecker and Peng (1989), who made use of the 10-box PANDORA box-model in order to assess the impact of variations in the export of North Atlantic Deep Water (NADW) on the alkalinity
- at the surface of the Southern Ocean, the pCO<sub>2</sub> of which was proposed to control that of the atmosphere. In this study it was suggested that a reduced export of low-alkalinity NADW, eventually reaching the surface Southern Ocean (via the deep Atlantic), might account for approximately half of the observed glacial – interglacial atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> change. In a subsequent study, Toggweiler (1999) made use of a hierarchy of box-
- <sup>25</sup> model experiments to illustrate the specific importance of deep-water ventilation (vertical mixing) locally in the Southern Ocean in setting atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub>, indicating that ~25% of the glacial interglacial CO<sub>2</sub> difference could be achieved, given a prescribed "biological pump" efficiency, by simply changing the net rate of export of carbon-rich water to the deep Southern Ocean. A similar effect, "bottling up" CO<sub>2</sub> in the deep

715

Southern Ocean, has been obtained by changing the density, and therefore the upwelling efficiency, of carbon-rich deep-water in the Southern Ocean (Gildor and Tziperman, 2001), and by "capping" the Southern Ocean with sea-ice (Keeling and Stephens, 2001). The differences between these last three physical mechanisms are rather sub-

- <sup>5</sup> tle, amounting to a shift in focus from the rate of deep-water export from the Southern Ocean (Toggweiler, 1999); to the rate of deep-water up-welling in the Southern Ocean (Gildor and Tziperman, 2001); to the modulation of the extent of equilibration of the surface Southern Ocean with the atmosphere (Keeling and Stephens, 2001). A more recent proposal (Watson and Naveira Garabato, 2006) for how Southern Ocean cir-
- <sup>10</sup> culation and mixing might control atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> levels has synthesised some of the main premises of the earlier hypotheses to provide a coherent mechanism that involves both a reduction in the overturning rate of the whole ocean (attributed to increased density stratification) and a suppression of up-welling (hence vertical mixing) in the uppermost Southern Ocean.
- It is notable that all of the "physical pump" mechanisms that have been proposed as significant controls on glacial – interglacial CO<sub>2</sub> change have referred to dynamical (ocean mixing rate) or kinetic (ocean – atmosphere exchange rate) effects. Consideration of changes in the geometry, and therefore the volumes, of different intra-oceanic carbon reservoirs (i.e. different deep-water "masses") has largely escaped explicit treat-
- 20 ment. One recent box-model simulation did include volumetric changes in the deepwater masses filling the ocean basins (Watson and Naveira Garabato, 2006), but did not examine their effects on CO<sub>2</sub> sequestration explicitly. The purpose of the present study is to address this specific issue, by advancing the simple hypothesis that changes in the volumes of different glacial deep-water masses, prior to their overturning or mix-
- ing rates, may significantly affect the amount of carbon that can be "bottled up" in the deep ocean. In this hypothesis, particular emphasis is placed on how the hypometry of the ocean basins (the area distribution at different water depths) may affect the efficiency of volumetric water-mass changes that are caused by the vertical shoaling/deepening of water-mass mixing boundaries. A notable fact in this regard is that

~56% of the sea-floor lies between 6000 and 3000 m (Menard and Smith, 1966), thus accounting for a majority increment in the ocean's volume. If a water mass that once occupied the >5 km interval in the Atlantic comes to occupy the >2 km interval, it will have increased its volume in this basin almost four-fold.

# 5 2 A thought experiment: a "southern flavour ocean"

One of the least ambiguous aspects of the palaeoclimate archive is the record of glacial – interglacial change in  $\delta^{13}$ C recorded by benthic foraminifera from the Atlantic Ocean (Duplessy et al., 1988; Curry and Oppo, 2005). The data suggest a very positive  $\delta^{13}$ C of dissolved inorganic carbon (DIC) in the upper ~2 km of the Atlantic, and a very

- <sup>10</sup> negative  $\delta^{13}$ C of DIC below this in the deepest Atlantic. The most widespread and wellsupported interpretation of these data is that they represent a redistribution of glacial northern – and southern sourced deep- and intermediate water-masses, including in particular an incursion of glacial southern-sourced deep-water (rich in re-mineralised nutrients, and hence low  $\delta^{13}$ C carbon) into the deep North Atlantic, up to a water
- depth of ~2–3 km (Curry et al., 1988; Duplessy et al., 1988; Oppo and Fairbanks, 1990; Oppo et al., 1990; Boyle, 1992). This interpretation draws implicit support from glacial benthic Cd/Ca and Zn/Ca ratios from the North Atlantic (Boyle, 1992; Keigwin and Lehmann, 1994; Marchitto et al., 2002), benthic radiocarbon measurements from the North Atlantic (Keigwin, 2004; Skinner and Shackleton, 2004; Robinson et al.,
- <sup>20</sup> 2005), neodymium isotope measurements ( $\varepsilon_{Nd}$ ) from the Southern Ocean (Rutberg et al., 2000; Piotrowski et al., 2004, 2005), as well as an elegant box-model investigation of the possible causes of glacial deep-ocean chemistry (Michel et al., 1995).

Given this one apparently robust constraint on the deep-water geometry near the height of the last glaciation, one question immediately arises: how much must the

volume of southern-sourced deep-water have increased in order to accomplish this change (i.e. filling the deep Atlantic, and dominating the deep-water export to the Indian and Pacific basins), and what would have been the immediate effect on deep-

717

water  $CO_2$  sequestration? Answering the first part of this question is straightforward enough: as noted above, based on the hypsometry of the Atlantic basin (Menard and Smith, 1966), raising the upper boundary of southern-sourced deep-water (assumed for the sake of argument to be flat) from 5 km to 2.5 km in the Atlantic requires this

- <sup>5</sup> water-mass to increase its Atlantic volume from just under ~20 million km<sup>3</sup> to nearly ~70 million km<sup>3</sup> (almost a 4-fold increase). In order to determine the eventual impact of this volumetric change on the carbon-storage capacity of the ocean we would require a great deal more information, including knowledge of the chemistry of the various deep-water masses in the ocean as well as their turnover and "ventilation"
- (atmosphere equilibration) rates, and the flux of dissolved carbon that they eventually incorporate via biological export. However, if we assume simplistically that nothing in the ocean changes except the volume occupied by southern-sourced deep-water (i.e. the chemistry and flow-rates of all water-masses stays the same, but not their volumetric contribution to the ocean's total budget) – and that ocean volume is constant – then
- <sup>15</sup> we can infer that for a 4-fold increase in the volume of AABW at the expense of NADW (having average TCO<sub>2</sub> concentrations of ~2280  $\mu$ mol kg<sup>-1</sup> and ~2180  $\mu$ mol kg<sup>-1</sup>, respectively (Broecker and Peng, 1989)) the ocean would need to gain ~63 Gt of carbon. If we ignore all carbon exchanges with the ocean except from the atmosphere, our thought experiment implies that pre-industrial atmospheric pCO<sub>2</sub> would be reduced by
- ~20 ppm. This is equivalent to ~25% of the total observed glacial interglacial CO<sub>2</sub> change (Siegenthaler et al., 2005).
  Clearly many of the assumptions made in this thought experiment are not entirely valid: the chemistry and dynamics, not to mention the character and rate of biological
- valid: the chemistry and dynamics, not to mention the character and rate of biological export, of the glacial ocean will not have remained constant. Nevertheless, palaeo ceanographic proxy evidence holds that the basic premise of the experiment is robust: the volume of southern-sourced deep-water did indeed increase significantly during the last glaciation. It seems important therefore to evaluate the impacts of this premise in a slightly more sophisticated way. Below, a simple box model is used to this end.

# 3 A box-model experiment

Figure 1 illustrates a simple box-model that has been constructed in order to explore in more detail the implications of deep-water mass geometry (and overturning rate) changes for glacial – interglacial CO<sub>2</sub> variability. This model comprises an atmosphere

- and six ocean boxes (Southern Ocean, low-latitude, North Atlantic, northern deepwater, intermediate-water and southern deep-water), and involves two coupled circulation cells driven by down welling in the southern- and northern high latitudes. Particle fluxes are treated as directly exported dissolved matter, with carbon, phosphate, and nitrogen being exported in fixed proportions, as defined by the Redfield Ratios
- (C:N:P=106:16:1), and carbonate being exported in fixed proportion to the total dissolved CO<sub>2</sub> of the water. The thermodynamics of the carbonate system are defined according to Millero (1995). The calculated components of the model include phosphate, alkalinity, total dissolved CO<sub>2</sub> (TCO<sub>2</sub>) and pCO<sub>2</sub>. Although the flow scheme of the box model essentially represents an Atlantic Ocean only, it is scaled to global
- <sup>15</sup> proportions so that the volumes and concentrations of the atmosphere and the ocean balance with global budgets (all of which are fixed input parameters). This scaling is expected to increase the sensitivity of the model atmosphere to changes in ocean-box parameters, and should be borne in mind. The model is initiated with the concentrations of all boxes set to the global average, except for the pCO<sub>2</sub> of the surface boxes
- and the atmosphere, which are set to zero. In all model runs, for 'modern' or 'glacial' conditions, temperatures and salinities are kept constant, under the premise that the effects of these changes, combined with the estimated changes in the terrestrial biosphere, will have approximately cancelled out (Sigman and Boyle, 2000).
- Particle fluxes in the model are defined as "export productivity" values and therefore represent the net amount of organic carbon exported from the surface to the deep Southern Ocean ( $P_s$ ), to the intermediate ocean ( $P_i$ ) and to the deep North Atlantic ( $P_n$ ). Exchange fluxes (mixing rates) are defined between boxes where net thermohaline circulation fluxes do not exist, providing a mechanism for mixing: 1) the low-latitude

719

and intermediate boxes; 2) the northern- and intermediate boxes; and 3) the northernand southern deep-water boxes. The addition of mixing fluxes across other box boundaries (where unidirectional flow is prescribed) would tend to damp contrasts between box concentrations, much like a "diffusivity" term. The resulting model is broadly similar

- to that of Toggweiler (1999), though it makes use of a rather different circulation set-up, devised in order to emphasise the bi-polar character of the Atlantic deep circulation and in order to more effectively decouple the average deep-sea chemistry from "vertical mixing rates", as opposed to deep water-mass geometry and overturning rates. Arguably, only a box-model that includes the export of deep-water from the southern
- ocean (currently the volumetrically largest body of deep-water formed) may represent a realistic depiction of the physical carbon pump. It is important to stress that this box model can only include a highly simplified representation of the ocean circulation system (which is described today only with great difficulty; see Ganachaud and Wunsch, 2000), such that the utility of such a model ultimately lies in providing a testing ground
- for geologically founded premises that are held in parallel, and in providing test criteria that may eventually be sought in or refuted by the geological record, or indeed more complex general circulation models. It should be stressed that the motivation of this study is not to provide a full explanation of glacial interglacial atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> change, but rather to advance a simple hypothesis that appears to have been overlooked, and to test its conceptual merit.
- The model will be explored in two stages. First, a "base-line" model parameterisation using modern input estimates will be defined, allowing the sensitivity and "skill" of the model to be evaluated. After this, the model will be applied to a "southern flavour" glacial scenario, where the deep ocean is dominated by southern-sourced deep-water,
- and where deep-water export rates are varied. This will provide an opportunity to test the capacity for changes in deep water-mass distributions (as well as their overturning rates) to significantly affect atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub>. Finally, the results of the model runs will be summarised and the implications of this study for millennial and glacial – interglacial changes in the carbon cycle will be drawn.

#### 4 Model parameterisation and inputs

The majority of the input parameters of the model (including chemical ratios, global masses, ocean volumes and areas, net flow rates, temperatures and salinities) are reasonably well constrained by modern measurements and estimates. Of less certainty

- <sup>5</sup> are the magnitudes of the particle fluxes (i.e. the export productivity to the intermediate and deep ocean) and the mixing rates in the ocean interior, both of which are absolutely critical in determining the partitioning of carbon between the ocean and the atmosphere. As noted above, the particle fluxes  $P_s$ ,  $P_l$  and  $P_n$  represent the export of organic carbon to the deep Southern Ocean, the intermediate low-latitude ocean and the deep North Atlantic respectively.
- Given that organic carbon is readily re-mineralised in the marine environment, with only ~1% reaching the deepest ocean (Martin et al., 1987; Santos et al., 1994; Chester, 2003),  $P_n$  and  $P_s$  will be only a fraction of  $P_l$ , the export productivity of the low-latitude surface ocean (100 m depth). Estimates summarised in Chester (2003) indicate an av-
- <sup>15</sup> erage export productivity (from 100 m water depth) of ~2 mol C m<sup>-2</sup> yr<sup>-1</sup> for both lowlatitude/equatorial and North Atlantic waters. The total global primary productivity is estimated to be ~11.9 mol C m<sup>-2</sup> yr<sup>-1</sup> (Chester, 2003), and ~12% of this should equal the net export of organic matter from the global surface ocean. Provided that a maximum of ~2% of primary production will reach a depth of ~2000 m (and thus enter the
- <sup>20</sup> deep boxes in the model presented here), and given that there is approximately twice as much primary production in the northern- versus the southern high-latitude Atlantic sectors (Longhurst et al., 1995), the particle fluxes  $P_s$ ,  $P_l$  and  $P_n$  can be estimated to be ~0.2, ~2 and ~0.4 mol C m<sup>-2</sup> yr<sup>-1</sup> respectively. Due to the longer residence time of organic matter in the intermediate box than in the northern and southern down-welling
- <sup>25</sup> boxes, the export of organic matter from the intermediate box to the deep boxes is set to 10 % of P<sub>1</sub>, or ~1% of the primary productivity, in line with modern estimates (Chester, 2003). This export flux is partitioned between the northern and southern deep boxes in proportion to their respective volumes.

721

In order to avoid the unrealistic situation of continued carbon export from the surface boxes when nutrient concentrations drop to zero, variable particulate fluxes are defined using a "Michaelis-Menton" type parameterisation, such that:

$$P = P_{\max} - \frac{P_{\max}}{1 + e^{(C_P - 0.01)/0.05}}$$
(1)

- <sup>5</sup> where *P* indicates the instantaneous particle flux,  $P_{max}$  represents the maximum particle flux (as defined for each surface box above), and  $C_P$  indicates the instantaneous "dissolved particle" concentration in the surface box. Numerical values in the exponential denominator of this function are arbitrarily chosen in order to produce a rapid tailing off of particle export only at very low nutrient concentrations.
- <sup>10</sup> Defining the mixing rates of the ocean interior, as represented in a simplified boxmodel, is most problematic. For this reason, these parameters have been treated initially as "free variables" and hence estimated on the basis of sensitivity tests and model skill in reproducing modern atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub>. Other model outputs (total dissolved CO<sub>2</sub>, phosphate and alkalinity) are then used to evaluate the overall skill of the
- <sup>15</sup> box-model, once is has been "tuned" to modern atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> in this way. The flow rates for the northern- and southern thermohaline circulation cells,  $F_n$  and  $F_s$ , respectively, are defined based on the estimates of Ganachaud and Wunsch (2003), with ~15 Sv of deep-water being exported southward from the North Atlantic and ~6 Sv being exported northward into the Atlantic from the Southern Ocean (giving a total of
- ~21 Sv of overturning in the ocean). The modern parameterisation outlined above, which represents a pre-industrial Holocene scenario, is summarised in Table 1. This parameterisation has been used as a basis for sensitivity tests, carried out by varying the main "tuning parameters" of the model: the particle fluxes, and the mixing rates.
  - 4.1 Model sensitivity
- The sensitivity of modelled atmospheric pCO<sub>2</sub> is illustrated in Figs. 2 and 3 (above) with respect to variable mixing rates ( $f_{Ii}$ ,  $f_{ns}$  and  $f_{ni}$ ), and in Figs. 4 and 5 with respect to

variable particle fluxes ( $P_s$ ,  $P_l$  and  $P_n$ ). Thus in Figs. 2 and 3 it is evident that modelled atmospheric pCO<sub>2</sub> is highly dependent on the magnitude of low latitude vertical mixing ( $f_{l_i}$ ) (i.e. stratification), moderately dependent on the mixing of intermediate- and North Atlantic water ( $f_{n_i}$ ) (i.e. intermediate-water up-welling in the North Atlantic), and essentially insensitive to the mixing of northern- and southern deep-water ( $f_{n_s}$ ).

<sup>5</sup> essentially insensitive to the mixing of northern- and southern deep-water ( $f_{ns}$ ). Based on the results illustrated in Figs. 2 and 3 (and the expectation that  $f_{ns} \ll f_{ni} < f_{li}$ ) the magnitudes of the mixing rates used for the Holocene model parameterisation have been estimated to yield modern atmospheric pCO<sub>2</sub>~280 ppm. It is notable that the viable range of values for  $f_{li}$  is bi-modal and relatively narrow (either ~5–10 or ~30–

- <sup>10</sup> 40 Sv), and that atmospheric pCO<sub>2</sub> is not particularly sensitive to  $f_{ns}$ . The northern vertical mixing term,  $f_{ni}$ , essentially determines whether the low-latitude vertical mixing term,  $f_{li}$ , should be high (~30–40 Sv) or low (~5–10 Sv). This means that modern atmospheric pCO<sub>2</sub> provides a strong constraint for setting the low-latitude vertical mixing  $(f_{li})$ , in conjunction with the northern vertical mixing  $(f_{ni})$  (assumed to be small relative
- to  $f_{II}$ , while the deep mixing ( $f_{ns}$ ) may be set freely so as to produce realistic contrasts in the chemical composition (i.e. phosphate, alkalinity and TCO<sub>2</sub>) of the various boxes it affects.

In Figs. 4 and 5, atmospheric  $pCO_2$  is shown to exhibit a strong sensitivity to changing particle fluxes, and in particular to changes in the Southern Ocean export produc-

- <sup>20</sup> tivity (P<sub>s</sub>). This observation has two main implications: first, that large changes in pCO<sub>2</sub> may be efficiently obtained by arbitrarily changing the particle fluxes (as observed in previous box models); and second, that the modern pCO<sub>2</sub> provides a rigid constraint for the combined parameterisation of the model's particle fluxes and vertical mixing rates (f<sub>*i*</sub> in particular). It is encouraging that the particle fluxes chosen on the basis
- of independent export productivity estimates (outlined above) can easily be made to yield modern atmospheric pCO<sub>2</sub> in conjunction with a reasonable and narrow range of vertical mixing rates.

723

#### 4.2 Model realism

The "skill" of the model in recreating modern conditions (given a choice of suitable parameters as outlined above) is illustrated in Fig. 6, where a comparison is made between modelled and observed estimates of phosphate, alkalinity and  $TCO_2$  for each

- <sup>5</sup> box. Modern estimates for Atlantic chemistry have been drawn from Broecker and Peng (1989) (based on the GEOSECS dataset) and from (Levitus, 1994). Although there is a tendency for the model to slightly overestimate the  $TCO_2$  of all boxes (believed to be a result of using a global carbon budget in a purely "Atlantic" flow-scheme), and to significantly overestimate the phosphate of northern- and southern deep-water, the
- relationship between all modelled and modern values is satisfactory, and essentially indistinguishable from unity (at the 95% confidence interval). Of course, this comparison does not demonstrate that the box-model is a complete depiction of the global climate system. However, given that the main "tuning parameter" values have not been arbitrarily chosen, it does provide some confidence that the model design is realistic enough
- to be applied to an initial test of the "southern flavour" CO<sub>2</sub> sequestration hypothesis outlined above.

# 5 Atmospheric pCO<sub>2</sub> for a "southern flavour" ocean

# 5.1 The "hypsometric effect"

In Table 1, one of the input parameters is the volume ratio of northern- to southern sourced deep-water. This ratio has been calculated as being ~8.9 today, on the basis of the Atlantic hypsometric curve (Menard and Smith, 1966), by assuming that North Atlantic sourced deep-water currently fills the depth interval ~2–5 km, and that Antarctic-sourced water fills the abyssal Atlantic >5 km (McCartney, 1992). It is notable that the largest volumetric increment in the Atlantic is the 4–5 km section (closely followed by the 5–6 km castion). This is illustrated in Fig. 7, where the volume ratio of two

lowed by the 5–6 km section). This is illustrated in Fig. 7, where the volume ratio of two

water-masses that occupy horizontally stratified intervals in the deep Atlantic (>2 km) is plotted against the depth of the horizontal boundary between the two water-masses. This plot suggests that the water-mass that occupies more than the 4–5 km depth interval will essentially define the chemistry of the average deep marine reservoir, via a "hypsometric effect".

# 5.2 Atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> linked to deep-water mass geometry and overturning

Figure 8 illustrates the effect of changing the relative volumes of the northern- and southern deep-water boxes in the model, expressed in terms of the ratio ( $R_{ns}$ ) of northern- to southern deep-water box volumes, as defined in Fig. 7. As described

- <sup>10</sup> above, the modern situation (North Atlantic deep-water filling the basin ~2–5 km depth) corresponds to  $R_{ns}$ ~8.9, while that inferred for the last glacial maximum, with southern-sourced deep-water filling the Atlantic basin up to 2.5 km depth, corresponds to  $R_{ns}$ ~0.3. When this value for  $R_{ns}$  is used in the box model (with all other parameters kept constant), CO<sub>2</sub> in the atmospheric box drops by ~55 ppm (Fig. 8), which is
- equivalent to nearly 70% of the total glacial interglacial  $CO_2$  change. The observed "hypsometric effect" on carbon sequestration in the deep sea only becomes significant (and then increases rapidly) once the volumes of the southern and northern deep-water boxes are roughly equal. This would represent a situation where southern-sourced deep water has shoaled above ~3.5 km water depth in the Atlantic. For a shoaling
- of southern sourced deep-water to only ~3 km,  $CO_2$  in the model drops by ~45 ppm; while for a near complete elimination of northern-sourced deep-water below 2 km water depth (i.e. a direct transfer of northern deep-water into the intermediate-depth ocean),  $CO_2$  drops by ~68 ppm.
- A significant "hypsometric" effect on atmospheric  $CO_2$  is thus confirmed in the box model, as suggested by the initial "southern flavour" thought experiment. However, as found in previous box-model simulations, atmospheric  $CO_2$  is also (indeed primarily) sensitive to the turnover rate of the ocean (in this case  $F_n$  and  $F_s$ ), as well as the maximum "particle" export rate from the surface ocean. What this means is that sig-

725

nificant changes in carbon sequestration in the deep sea may be achieved by either changing the rate at which carbon in the deep-sea is "flushed out" by the overturning circulation and replenished by biological export (e.g. Sarmiento and Toggweiler, 1984; Toggweiler, 1999), or by filling the deep-sea with a particularly carbon-rich deep-water

- <sup>5</sup> mass analogous to modern Antarctic Bottom Water (AABW), or by some additive combination of these. A "target" glacial atmospheric  $CO_2$  level of ~200 ppm can therefore be easily reproduced in the box-model by using a variety of combinations of: 1) increased southern deep-water volume; 2) reduced overturning rates, of either southern ( $F_s$ ) or northern ( $F_n$ ) deep-water; and 3) increased particle export rates, especially in the Southern Ocean.
- In previous box model investigations of marine carbon sequestration it was found that changes in the biological export of carbon to the deep sea or in the turnover rate of the ocean that were large enough to reproduce glacial atmospheric  $CO_2$  levels, also tended to produce unrealistically dysoxic deep-waters (Toggweiler, 1999). In the
- box-model described here, a significant increase in the volume of southern sourced deep-water allows this to be avoided (based on changes in phosphate concentration, southern/northern deep-water oxygenation levels drop/increase by ~20%), primarily by decreasing the need to appeal to extreme changes in overturning- or biological export rates. This is illustrated in Fig. 9, where an increase in the budget of southern deep-
- water filling the box-model ocean is shown to reduce the need to invoke large changes in ocean overturning or biological export in order to reproduce a glacial CO<sub>2</sub> levels. By filling the deep ocean with southern sourced deep-water, atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> drops and becomes less sensitive to changes in the northern overturning cell, while also becoming more sensitive to biological export- and overturning circulation changes in
- the Southern Ocean. The carbon content of the deep ocean may thus become highly dependent on its dominant overturning circulation route, as distinct from its overturning circulation rate.

In the real ocean, a large increase in the volume of southern-sourced deep-water exported to the Atlantic and Indo-Pacific basins would require an increase in the amount

of water that has been converted from deep- and abyssal waters in the Southern Ocean (Orsi et al., 1999). This could be achieved via both thermohaline- and wind forcing; by: 1) increasing the density gradient between southern- and northern deep-water so as to stabilise the southern component over a broader density range of the deep ocean

- <sup>5</sup> (Cox, 1989; Hughes and Weaver, 1994; Brix and Gerdes, 2003); and/or 2) reducing the "Ekman suction" in the Southern Ocean by winding down the Antarctic Circumpolar Current (ACC), either via a reduced westerly wind stress (Toggweiler and Samuels, 1998), or via a reduced density gradient (and buoyancy flux) across this current (Cox, 1989; Karsten and Marshall, 2002). The mechanisms responsible for increasing the
- <sup>10</sup> budget of deep-water exported northwards from deep within the ACC could therefore closely overlap with those outlined by Watson and Naviera Garabato (2006) for reducing the up-welling rate in the upper Southern Ocean (thus causing deep- and intermediate water to be re-circulated internally instead). If, as proposed by Watson and Naviera Garabato (2006), this mechanism relied in part on an increase in the vertical density
- <sup>15</sup> gradient in the Southern Ocean, this would also ensure that turbulent vertical diffusive mixing (which may have been enhanced in a shallower glacial ocean (Wunsch, 2002)) would only serve to homogenise the deepest ocean carbon reservoir, without causing it to "leak" into the surface-ocean and atmosphere.

Note that the rate at which southern-sourced deep-water is exported need not increase in these scenarios as long as the standing volume of southern sourced deepwater has stabilised. For a constant overturning rate of this (poorly "CO<sub>2</sub> ventilated") southern sourced deep-sea reservoir, an increase in its volume equates to a proportionate increase in the residence time of carbon in that reservoir. Unless the rate of biological export of carbon from the surface ocean into this deep-sea reservoir de-

<sup>25</sup> creases significantly at the same time, this will necessitate a net increase in the amount of carbon that is stored in the deep-sea.

727

# 6 Closing the deficit of explained CO<sub>2</sub> change

The main purpose of the present study is not to attempt a complete simulation or explanation of last glacial maximum atmospheric  $CO_2$  levels, but rather to investigate the plausibility and possible implications of a "hypsometric effect" on  $CO_2$  sequestration,

- <sup>5</sup> which would arise due to large changes in the volume of southern-sourced deep-water filling the ocean basins. The "southern flavour ocean" theory proposed here has the advantage of being relatively parsimonious in its premises (i.e. it requires few changes to the ocean system in order to operate), and of being based on premises that should be easily refutable by proxy evidence, yet nonetheless are well supported by available
- data and modelling studies (Duplessy et al., 1988; Michel et al., 1995; Rutberg et al., 2000; Kim et al., 2003; Shin et al., 2003; Piotrowski et al., 2004, 2005; Curry and Oppo, 2005). Furthermore, the proposed changes in the volumetric dominance of southern-sourced deep-water might be expected to be controlled by its density, and therefore to vary inversely to changes in its temperature. This may suggest a mechanism that
- <sup>15</sup> could explain the proposed links between atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> and those components of the deep-water temperature and global ice-volume records that cannot be explained by linear insolation forcing (Shackleton, 2000; Parrenin and Paillard, 2003).

It is worth noting that the operation of the hypsometric effect in the box-model described here is not primarily dependent on an exaggeration of the efficiency of gas

- exchange at high latitudes (Archer et al., 2000a; Toggweiler et al., 2003a, b) since it operates via changes in the relative magnitudes of different intra-oceanic carbon reservoirs, rather than changes in their extent of equilibration with the atmosphere. Indeed, the hypothesis proposed here essentially functions through an expansion of a "glacial analogue of AABW" to the majority of the deep ocean. What the proposed mechanism
- does require is that glacial deep-water formation in the southern ocean operated in a broadly similar fashion to today, with a significant amount of water-mass conversion occurring away from the air-sea interface, and that vertical diffusivity was not so large (Archer et al., 2000a, b), or could not operate so efficiently against density gradients in

the glacial ocean, that it was able to erode vertical gradients in carbon content more efficiently than they could be replaced by the physical and biological export mechanisms posited here.

Further studies, using more complete and complex model simulations, will be re-

- quired in order to determine more securely the veracity and magnitude of the proposed hypsometric effect. Nevertheless, if this simple mechanism for enhancing deep-sea carbon sequestration is incorporated explicitly into the list of "ingredients" that have contributed to glacial – interglacial CO<sub>2</sub> change (Archer et al., 2000b; Sigman and Boyle, 2000), it may help to reduce the "CO<sub>2</sub> deficit" that remains to be explained by
- appealing to more "extreme" or controversial processes. Although, as previously, the mystery of glacial – interglacial CO<sub>2</sub> change still eludes us (Archer et al., 2000b), perhaps it is not quite as distant as we might have believed?

Acknowledgements. This work was enabled by a Research Fellowship held by the author at Christ's College, at the University of Cambridge. The author is very grateful for interesting
 discussions with D. Paillard, T. Stocker and A. Timmermann. The author is particularly grateful for helpful and insightful discussions with E. Gloor, as well as his comments on an initial version of this manuscript.

#### References

25

- Archer, D., Eshel, G., Winguth, A., Broecker, W. S., Pierrehumbert, R., Tobis, M., and Jacob, R.:
  Atmospheric pCO<sub>2</sub> sensitivity to the bioloical pump in the ocean, Global Biochem. Cycles, 14, 1219–1230, 2000a.
  - Archer, D. and Maier-Reimer, E.: Effect of deep-sea sedimentary calcite preservation on atmospheric CO2 concentration, Nature, 367, 260–263, 1994.
  - Archer, D., Winguth, A., Lea, D. W., and Mahowald, N.: What caused the glacial/interglacial atmospheric pCO<sub>2</sub> cycles?, Rev. Geophys., 38, 159–189, 2000b.
- Bard, E.: Correction of accelerator mass spectrometry <sup>14</sup>C ages measured in planktonic foraminifera: Paleoceanographic implications, Paleoceanography, 3, 635–645, 1988.

729

- Boyle, E.: Cadmium and d13C paleochemical ocean distributions during the Stage 2 glacial maximum, Ann. Rev. Earth Planet. Sci., 20, 245–287, 1992.
- Boyle, E. A.: The role of vertical fractionation in controlling late Quaternary atmospheric carbon dioxide, J. Geophys. Res., 93, 15701–15714, 1988.
- Brix, H. and Gerdes, R.: North Atlantic Deep Water and Antarctic Bottom Water: Their interaction and influence on the variability of the global ocean circulation, J. Geophys. Res., 108(C2), doi:10.1029-2002JC0021335, 2003.
  - Broecker, W.: How strong is the Harvardton-Bear constraint?, Global Biogeochem. Cycles, 13, 817–820, 1999.
- <sup>10</sup> Broecker, W. S.: Glacial to interglacial changes in ocean chemistry, Progress in Oceanography, 11, 151–197, 1982a.

Broecker, W. S.: Ocean chemistry during glacial time, Geochim. Cosomochim. Acta, 46, 1698–1705, 1982b.

Broecker, W. S. and Peng, T.-H.: The cause of the glacial to interglacial atmospheric CO2 change: a polar alkalinity hypothesis, Global Biogeochem. Cycles, 3, 215–239, 1989.

Chester, R.: Marine Geochemistry, Blackwell, Oxford, 2003.

Cox, M. D.: An idealized model of the world ocean. Part I: The global-scale water masses, J. Phys. Oceanogr., 19, 1730–1752, 1989.

- Curry, W. B., Duplessy, J. C., Labeyrie, L. D., and Shackleton, N. J.: Changes in the distribution of d13C of deep water sigma-CO2 between the last glaciation and the Holocene, Paleoceanography, 3, 317–341, 1988.
  - Curry, W. B. and Oppo, D. W.: Glacial water mass geometry and the distribution of d13C of Sigma-CO2 in the western Atlantic Ocean, Paleoceanography, 20, PA1017, doi:10.1029/2004PA001021, 2005.
- <sup>25</sup> Duplessy, J.-C., Shackleton, N. J., Fairbanks, R. G., Labeyrie, L., Oppo, D., and Kallel, N.: Deep water source variations during the last climatic cycle and their impact on global deep water circulation, Paleoceanography, 3, 343–360, 1988.

Ganachaud, A. and Wunsch, C.: Improved estimates of global ocean circulation, heat transport and mixing from hydrographic data, Nature, 408, 453–457, 2000.

- Gildor, H. and Tziperman, E.: Physical mechanisms behind biogeochemical glacial-interglacial CO<sub>2</sub>variations, Geophys. Res. Lett., 28, 2421–2424, 2001.
  - Hughes, T. M. C. and Weaver, A. J.: Multiple Equilibria of an Asymmetric Two-Basin Ocean Model, J. Phys. Oceanogr., 28, 619–637, 1994.

- Karsten, R. H. and Marshall, J.: Testing theories of the vertical stratification of the ACC against observations, Dynamics of Atmospheres and Oceans, 36, 233–246, 2002.
- Keeling, R. F. and Stephens, B. B.: Antarctic sea ice and the control of Pleistocene climate instability, Paleoceanography, 16, 112–131, 2001.
- Keigwin, L. D.: Radiocarbon and stable isotope constraints on Last Glacial Maximum and Younger Dryas ventilation in the western North Atlantic, Paleoceanography, 19, 1–15, 2004. Keigwin, L. D. and Lehmann, S. J.: Deep circulation change linked to Heinrich event 1 and Younger Dryas in a mid-depth North Atlantic core, Paleoceanography, 9, 185–194, 1994. Kim, S.-J., Flato, G. M., and Boer, G. J.: A coupled climate model simulation of the Last Glacial
- Maximum, Part 2: approach to equilibrium, Clim. Dyn., 20, 635–661, 2003. Knox, F. and McElroy, M.: Changes in atmospheric CO2: influence of marine biota at high latitude, J. Geophys. Res., 89, 4629–4637, 1984.

Levitus, S.: World Ocean Atlas, NOAA, Washington D.C., 1994.

- Longhurst, A., Sathyendranath, S., Platt, T., and Caverhill, C.: An estimate of global primary production in the ocean from satellite radiometer data, J. Plankton Res., 17, 1245–1271, 1995.
  - Marchitto, T. M., Oppo, D. W., and Curry, W. B.: Paired benthic foraminiferal Cd/Ca and Zn/Ca evidence for a greatly increased presence of Southern Ocean Water in the glacial North Atlantic, Paleoceanography, 17, 10.1–10.16, 2000PA000598, 2002.
- Martin, J. H., Knauer, G. A., Karl, D. M., and Broenkow, W. W.: VERTEX: carbon cycling in the northeast Pacific, Deep Sea Res., 34, 267–286, 1987.

McCartney, M. S.: Recirculating components to the deep boundary current of the northern North Atlantic, Progress in Oceanography, 29, 283–383, 1992.

- Menard, H. W. and Smith, S. M.: Hypsometry of ocean basin provinces, J. Geophys. Res., 71, 4305–4325, 1966.
  - Michel, E., Labeyrie, L., Duplessy, J.-C., and Gorfti, N.: Could deep Subantarctic convection feed the worl deep basins during last glacial maximum?, Paleoceanography, 10, 927–942, 1995.
  - Naviera Garabato, A. C., Polzin, K. L., King, B. A., Heywood, K. J., and Visbeck, M.: Widespread intense turbulent mixing in the Southern Ocean, Science, 303, 210–213, 2004.
- Oppo, D. and Fairbanks, R. G.: Atlantic ocean thermohaline circulation of the last 150 000 years: Relationship to climate and atmospheric CO2, Paleoceanography, 5, 277–288, 1990. Oppo, D. W., Fairbanks, R. G., Gordon, A. L., and Shackleton, N. J.: Late Pleistocene Southern

731

Ocean d<sup>13</sup>C variability, Paleoceanography, 5, 43–54, 1990.

- Orsi, A. H., Johnson, G. C., and Bullister, J. L.: Circulation, mixing and production of Antarctic Bottom Water, Progress in Oceanography, 43, 55–109, 1999.
- Parrenin, F. and Paillard, D.: Amplitude and phase of glacial cycles from a conceptual model, Earth Planet. Sci. Lett., 214, 243–250, 2003.
- Piotrowski, A., Goldstein, S. L., Hemming, S. R., and Fairbanks, R. G.: Temporal relationships of carbon cycling and ocean circulation at glacial boundaries, Science, 307, 1933–1938, 2005.
  - Piotrowski, A. M., Goldstein, S. L., Hemming, S. R., and Fairbanks, R. G.: Intensification and
- variability of ocean thermohaline circulation through the last deglaciation, Earth Planet. Sci. Lett., 225, 205–220, 2004.
- Robinson, L. F., Adkins, J. F., Keigwin, L. D., Southon, J., Fernandez, D. P., Wang, S.-L., and Scheirer, D. S.: Radiocarbon variability in the western North Atlantic during the last deglaciation, Science, 310, 1469–1473, 2005.
- Rutberg, R. L., Heming, S. R., and Goldstein, S. L.: Reduced North Atlantic Deep Water flux to the glacial Southern Ocean inferred from neodymium isotope ratios, Nature, 405, 935–938, 2000.
  - Sabine, C., Feely, R. A., Gruber, N., Key, R. M., Lee, K., Bullister, J. L., Wanninkhof, R., Wong, C. S., Wallace, D. W. R., Tilbrook, B., Millero, F. J., Peng, T.-H., Kozyr, A., Ono, T., and Rios, A. F.: The oceanic sink for anthropogenic CO2, Science, 305, 367–371, 2004.
- Santos, V., Billett, D. S. M., Rice, A. L., and Wolff, G. A.: Organic matter in deep-sea sediments from the Porcupine Abyssal Plain in the northeast Atlantic Ocean. I Lipids, Deep Sea Res., 41, 787–819, 1994.
- Sarmiento, J. L. and Toggweiler, R.: A new model for the role of the oceans in determining atmospheric pCO2, Nature, 308, 621–624, 1984.
- Shackleton, N. J.: The 100 000-year ice-age cycle identified and found to lag temperature, carbon dioxide and orbital eccentricity, Science, 289, 1897–1902, 2000.
- Shin, S. I., Liu, Z., Otto-Bliesner, B. L., Brady, E. C., Kutzbach, J. E., and Harrison, S. P.: A simulation of the last glacial maximum limate using the NCAR-CCSM, Clim. Dyn., 20, 127–151, 2003.
- Siegenthaler, U., Stocker, T. F., Monnin, E., Luthi, D., Schwander, J., Stauffer, B., Raynaud, D., Barnola, J.-M., Fischer, H., Masson-Delmotte, V., and Jouzel, J.: Stable carbon cycle climate relationship during the Late Pleistocene, Science, 310, 1313–1317, 2005.

Siegenthaler, U. and Wenk, T.: Rapid atmospheric CO2 variations and ocean circulation, Nature, 308, 624–625, 1984.

- Sigman, D. M. and Boyle, E. A.: Glacial/interglacial variations in atmospheric carbon dioxide, Nature, 407, 859–869, 2000.
- Skinner, L. C. and Shackleton, N. J.: Rapid transient changes in Northeast Atlantic deep-water ventilation-age across Termination I, Paleoceanography, 19, 1–11, doi:10.1029/2003PA000983, 2004.

Speer, K., Rintoul, S. R., and Sloyan, B.: The diabatic deacon cell, J. Phys. Oceanogr., 30, 3212–3222, 2000.

<sup>10</sup> Toggweiler, J. R.: Variation of atmospheric CO2 by ventilation of the ocean's deepest water, Paleoceanography, 14, 571–588, 1999.

Toggweiler, J. R., Gnanadesikan, A., Carson, S., Murnane, R., and Sarmiento, J. L.: Representation of the carbon cycle in box models and GCMs: 1. Solubility pump, Global Biogechem. Cycles, 17, 26.1–26.11, doi:10.1029/2001GB001401, 2003a.

Toggweiler, J. R., Murnane, R., Carson, S., Gnanadesikan, A., and Sarmiento, J. L.: Representation of the carbon cycle in box models and GCMs: 2. Organic pump, Global Biogeochem. Cycles, 17, 27.1–27.13, doi:10.1029/2001GB001841, 2003b.

Toggweiler, J. R. and Samuels, B.: On the Ocean's Large-Scale Circulation near the Limit of No Vertical Mixing, J. Phys. Oceanogr., 28, 1832–1852, 1998.

Toggweiler, J. R. and Sarmiento, J. L.: Glacial to interglacial changes in atmospheric carbon dioxide: the critical role of ocean surface water in high latitudes, in: The Carbon Cycle and Atmospheric CO2: Natural Variations Archean to Present, pp. 163–184, Geophys. Monograph, American Geophysical Union, 1985.

Watson, A. J. and Naveira Garabato, A. C.: The role of Southern Ocean mixing and upwelling in glacial – interglacial atmospheric CO2 change, Tellus 58B, 73–87, 2006.

Webb, D. J. and Suginohara, N.: Vertical mixing in the ocean, Nature, 409, 37, 2001. Wunsch, C.: What is the thermohaline circulation?, Science, 298, 1179–1181, 2002.

733

Table 1. Input parameterisation for modern model scenario.

Parameter	Parameter label	Value	Parameter	Parameter label	Values
Fluxes			Temperature, salinity		
Northern overturning	F,	15 Sv	Southern temperature	T <sub>s</sub>	5°C
Southern overturning	Fs	6 Sv	Low lat. temperature	T,	21.5°C
Low lat. vertical mixing	f <sub>//</sub>	35 Sv	Northern temperature	Т,	8°C
Northern vertical mixing	f <sub>ni</sub>	8 Sv	Southern salinity	S <sub>s</sub>	34.7‰
Deep mixing	f <sub>ns</sub>	5 Sv	Low lat. salinity	S <sub>1</sub>	36.0
Gas exchange – south	G <sub>s</sub>	5 m day <sup>-1</sup>	Northern salinity	S <sub>n</sub>	35.0‰
Gas exchange – low lat.	G <sub>1</sub>	3 m day <sup>-1</sup>	Particle fluxes		
Gas exchange – north	G <sub>n</sub>	5 m day <sup>-1</sup>	Southern export	P <sub>s</sub>	0.2 mol Cm <sup>-2</sup> yr <sup>-1</sup>
Volumes, areas			Low lat. export	Ρ,	2.0 mol Cm <sup>-2</sup> yr <sup>-1</sup>
Total volume ocean	V <sub>o</sub>	1.3×10 <sup>18</sup> m <sup>3</sup>	Northern export	P <sub>n</sub>	0.4 mol Cm <sup>-2</sup> yr <sup>-1</sup>
Total area ocean	A <sub>o</sub>	3.5×10 <sup>14</sup> m <sup>3</sup>	Redfield ratios		
Volume atmosphere	V <sub>atm</sub>	1.773×10 <sup>20</sup> moles	Carbon/phosphorus	C/P	106
N. Atlantic area/total area	$A_n/A_o$	0.2	Nitrogen/phosphorus	N/P	16
S. Atlantic area/total area	$A_s/A_o$	0.35	Southern CaCO <sub>3</sub> /TCO <sub>2</sub>	S-CaCO <sub>3</sub> /CO <sub>2</sub>	0.10
Vol. NADW/Vol. AABW	RV <sub>ns</sub>	0.5	Low lat. CaCO <sub>3</sub> /TCO <sub>2</sub>	L-CaCO <sub>3</sub> /CO <sub>2</sub>	0.20
Global masses			Northern CaCO <sub>3</sub> /TCO <sub>2</sub>	N-CaCO <sub>3</sub> /CO <sub>2</sub>	0.25
Total phosphate	P <sub>glob</sub>	2.769×10 <sup>15</sup> mol			
Total alkalinity	A <sub>alob</sub>	3.14×10 <sup>18</sup> mol			
Total CO <sub>2</sub>	TCO <sub>2glob</sub>	3.0379×10 <sup>18</sup> mol			



**Fig. 1.** Box-model schematic (S, southern surface; L, low-latitude surface; N, northern surface; ND, north deep; Int, intermediate; SD, south deep). Heavy black lines indicate thermohaline circulation ( $F_n$  = northern overturning;  $F_s$  = southern overturning). Red arrows indicate two-way exchange (i.e. mixing) terms. Blue arrows indicate gas exchange. Grey arrows indicate particle fluxes. The particle fluxes to the deep boxes are partitioned according to the relative volumes of the ND and SD boxes (see text).





**Fig. 2.** Sensitivity of modelled atmospheric pCO<sub>2</sub> ( $\mu$ atm) to variable low-latitude ( $f_{l_i}$ ) and northern ( $f_{n_i}$ ) vertical mixing rates. Other model parameters are as listed in Table 1.



**Fig. 3.** Sensitivity of modelled atmospheric  $pCO_2$  ( $\mu$ atm) to low-latitude ( $f_{Ii}$ ) and deep ( $f_{ns}$ ) mixing rates. Other model parameters are as listed in Table 1.





**Fig. 4.** Sensitivity of modelled atmospheric  $pCO_2$  ( $\mu$ atm) to variable particle export fluxes (North Atlantic,  $P_n$ ; South Atlantic,  $P_s$ ; Low-latitude,  $P_l$ ). Other model parameters are as listed in Table 1.



**Fig. 5.** Sensitivity of modelled atmospheric  $pCO_2$  ( $\mu$ atm) to variable northern- and southern particle fluxes. Other model parameters are as listed in Table 1.





**Fig. 6.** Model skill, for modern reconstruction of phosphate, alkalinity and total dissolved  $CO_2$  ( $\Sigma CO_2$ ). Data labels indicate boxes: L, Low-latitude surface; N, North surface; S, South surface; Int, Intermediate; ND, North deep; SD, South deep. Model parameters are listed in Table 1. Solid red lines and dotted black lines indicate least squares regression onto the data and 95% confidence intervals respectively. Solid black lines indicate 1:1 relationship.



**Fig. 7.** Volume ratio of northern (upper) deep-water to southern (lower) deep-water plotted against the depth of the base of the upper deep-water layer, as defined by the hypsometry of the Atlantic basin (Menard and Smith, 1966).





**Fig. 8.** Simulated changes in atmospheric  $CO_2$ , with respect to modern (280 ppm) caused by varying the ratio of northern- to southern sourced deep-water  $(V_n/V_s)$  filling the Atlantic. GSDW refers to "glacial southern sourced deep water", the glacial analogue for modern AABW.



**Fig. 9.** Changes in atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub>, from modern (280 ppm), produced in the box-model for different volume ratios of northern- versus southern deep-water ( $R_{ns}$ ), in conjunction with: 1) changes in southern overturning; 2) changes in northern overturning; and 3) changes in the maximum level of southern ocean export productivity.

743